

**THE UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT SAN ANTONIO  
DOCUMENTS AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE GRADUATE COUNCIL  
ACTION MINUTES  
ORDER OF BUSINESS**

**March 3, 2009**

**John Peace Library 4.03.08  
3:30 p.m.**

**Present:** Gabriel Acevedo, Sos Aгаian, Sonia Alconini (for Michael Cepek), John Alexander, Shereen Bhalla, Stuart Birnbaum (for Lance Lambert); Rena Bizios, Andrey Chabanov, Bill Cooke, James Dykes, Roger Enriquez, Walter Ermler; Dorothy Flannagan, Larry Golden, Mary Kay Houston-Vega, David Jaffe, Palani-Rajan Kadapakkam, William McCrary, Gregg Michel, Seyed Moussa Mirehei, Maricela Oliva, Mark Saenz, Can (John) Saygin, Scott Sherer, Eugene Stone-Romero, Ram Tripathi, Lila Truett, John Warren, Jose Weissmann, Raj Wilson, Weining Zhang

**Absent:** Astrid Dewath, John Garza, Christopher Gonzalez, Kim Kline, Renee Nank, Alastair Olive, Yinlong (Allen) Zhang

**Excused:** Norma Cantu; Michael Cepek, Mari Cortez, Karl Eschbach, Lance Lambert, Emeka Nwaeze, Malgorzata Oleszkiewicz-Peralba, David Romero, Howard Smith

**Visitors:** Dennis Haynes, Dean College of Public Policy  
Gayle Nicoll, Chair Department of Architecture  
Christopher Reddick, Chair Department of Public Administration  
Richard Tangum, Professor of Architecture

**I. Call to order and taking of attendance.**

Dr. William McCrary called the March 3, 2009 meeting of the Graduate Council to order at 3:36 pm.

**II. Approval of Minutes (William McCrary)**

The Minutes of the February 3, 2009 meeting were approved.

**III. Reports**

**A. Council Chair (William McCrary)**

No report

**B. Dean of Graduate School (Dorothy Flannagan)**

Dean Dorothy Flannagan reminded the Graduate Council that the Lone Star Graduate Diversity Colloquium will be hosted by UTSA on March 27<sup>th</sup> and 28<sup>th</sup>. It is part of the statewide Closing the Gaps Initiative. About 250 students have already enrolled (100 students from UTSA and 150 from other schools). Information about the colloquium is posted on the Graduate School website:

[http://www.utsa.edu/graduate/Events/graduateFairLisa\\_08updated.html](http://www.utsa.edu/graduate/Events/graduateFairLisa_08updated.html)

Both Lisa Palacios and Dean Flannagan can provide more information.

Dean Flannagan explained that representatives of the Noel-Levitz consulting firm had visited UTSA on February 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> to provide advice on enrollment management. Originally the focus had been on undergraduate enrollments, but their visit was expanded to include a half day on graduate enrollments. They had a focus group with faculty, a focus group with students, and a 1.5 hour meeting. Based on the exit interview, Dean Flannagan expects their report will likely include a discussion of flexible learning experiences, recommendations on recruitment, and strategically planned growth based on program resources. She gave 3/2 plans as one example of a flexible learning experience. Undergraduate students in 3/2 plans are recruited early and admitted into a graduate program while they finish their undergraduate degree. Dean Flannagan will share the consultants' recommendations when the final report is received.

**C. Secretary (Jim Dykes)**

The list of Graduate Council members (with their terms) was distributed as Attachment A of the Agenda. Dr. Jim Dykes explained that Department Chairs had been asked to hold elections for members completing the second of their two-year terms. The results of the election will be presented at our April 7<sup>th</sup> meeting. Newly elected members will serve two-year terms from September 2009 to May 2011. Department Chairs were also notified of members who will serve their second year of their two-year term next year. All Graduate Council members should have been cc:ed on the email. They were asked to help Dr. Dykes correct any errors.

**D. Committee on Graduate Programs and Courses (Gabriel Acevedo)**

Dr. McCrary moved that the Graduate Council vote to suspend our Bylaws in order to allow our invited guests from Architecture and Public Policy to discuss their program proposal and evaluation. His motion was unanimously approved.

Dr. Gabriel Acevedo first provided an update on program proposals. The PhD in Sociology proposal (approved by the Graduate Council on February 3<sup>rd</sup>) has been forwarded to the Faculty Senate. The MA in School Psychology proposal has been reviewed by the committee and the committee comments have been sent to the program. Two certification proposals (ESL and Management) and the PhD in Economics program are in process.

Dr. Acevedo introduced the visitors for the MS in Urban and Regional Planning (MSURP) proposal: Drs. Haynes, Reddick, Tangum, and Nicoll. After his committee reviewed the proposal, a consolidated list of comments and questions was sent to the program. The program's response was so thorough that no follow up meeting was required before the committee unanimously approved the proposal. After referring to the executive summary (Attachment B of the Agenda), Dr. Acevedo presented a set of PowerPoint slides. He noted that the committee was impressed with the proposal's focus on land use, design, policy, and economic, environmental, & cultural issues; especially since they are so important to the South Texas region. The program is designed both to develop research capabilities and to prepare professional practitioners. The committee was also impressed at the proposal's analysis of need and support. Across the private, public, and non-profit sectors, employment is expected to grow 15% between 2006 and 2016. Most (about 68%) of the new jobs are expected to be with local governments.

Consistent with those expectations, the support of local government officials (including the San Antonio mayor, a councilman, the City Manager, and a County Judge) was presented along with other public and private support. Dr. Acevedo explained that students will be recruited in Bexar County, South Texas, and nationally with specific attention being given to potential minority students. That attention is reflected in the current enrollment in urban planning classes (43% women and 50% minorities) and in the 30 graduate students in the certification program (70% minorities and 50% women). Consistent with current grants, the College of Architecture will develop internship and assistantship positions to attract and support graduate students. He presented the program of study: 48 hours total comprised of core courses (27 hours), electives (15 hours), and capstone (6 hours). The Library provides support for the proposal in terms of both books and periodicals (\$16,500 was budgeted in 2008 to purchase new books in urban and regional planning). The floor was opened for discussion.

Dr. Rena Bizios asked about similar programs in the region and Dr. Tangum explained that there are currently three programs (UT Austin, UT Arlington, and Texas A&M) and a proposed program at Texas Southern is being considered. Dr. Stone-Romero asked if the local focus might present a problem in the future if the local market became saturated. Dr. Tangum reported that he had just finished three grants that found high demand in both South Texas and nationally. In response to a question by Dr. Raj Wilson, Dr. Tangum explained that the program will be housed in the College of Architecture, but that the graduate program committee will be composed of an equal number of members from the Colleges of Architecture and Public Policy. Dr. Stuart Birnbaum asked about the number of programs and whether the proposed 48 hour curriculum is common. Dr. Tangum stated that there are 66 programs nationally (including the three current and one being reviewed in Texas) and that 48 hours are required for accreditation. The Graduate Council was pleased with the proposed student recruitment and faculty. Drs. Haynes and Tangum described the interdisciplinary recruitment of students (current certification students include and environmental engineer, a public administrator, a banker, and an architect) and the proactive hiring of faculty (including an awareness of the important role of transportation in urban planning). The Graduate Council unanimously approved the proposal.

#### **E. Membership Committee (Scott Sherer)**

Dr. Scott Sherer presented the list of 15 applicants that his committee recommended to be Special Members of the Graduate Faculty. Dr. Linda Brent was added to Attachment C of the Agenda. It was noted that 14 applicants held doctorates and, in response to a question by Dr. Wilson, Drs. Sherer and Bizios noted that Yogita Sharma is listed as all but dissertation (ABD). The entire slate of applicants was unanimously approved.

Then Dr. Sherer presented his committee's proposed revision to the Graduate Council Bylaws (Attachment D of the Agenda). He reminded the members that any proposed amendment must be distributed at least 30 days prior to any vote. He explained that the proposal was intended to clarify procedures, to reflect new needs of departments as the University has grown, and to acknowledge that the terminal degree in some fields has changed over time. His expectation is that the draft resulting from this meeting's discussion would be considered for a vote at our April 7<sup>th</sup> meeting. If approved, it would

go into effect in May with changes to the applicant review form (not a part of the Bylaws).

Drs. Stone-Romero and Bizios expressed concerns over who might be included in the category “individuals with recognized expertise who are unaffiliated with institutions of higher education” and whether it is appropriate to have a thesis or dissertation committee co-chaired by anyone other than a full-time tenured or tenure-track faculty member at UTSA. Dr. Sherer noted that applicants were recommended by the program’s Graduate Program Committee, Graduate Program Committee’s Chair, the Department Chair, and the College Dean prior to being reviewed by his Membership Committee. He also pointed out that the proposed provision would reduce the review cycle for Special Members not holding terminal degrees from three years to two years. In response, it was noted that some individuals may lack teaching expertise, that departments face budgetary issues, and that thesis and dissertation chairs and co-chairs directly represent UTSA. A lively discussion followed.

Part of the discussion focused on the history of the rule to allow Special Members to co-chair thesis and dissertation committees. While a number of people acknowledged that the rule predated their service on the Graduate Council, Dr. Palani-Rajan Kadapakkam explained that the rule resulted from a discussion of the roles for adjoint and adjunct faculty. Some supported allowing their service as chairs and others opposed their service as chairs. The co-chair rule was the compromise. A number of members (including Drs. Acevedo, Bizios, Chabanov, Cooke, Dykes, Ermler, Flannagan, Houston-Vega, McCrary, Stone-Romero, Tripathi, Truett, and Wilson) joined the discussion of the pros and cons of Special Members of the Graduate Faculty teaching graduate courses and co-chairing thesis and dissertation committees. As pros, some discussants focused on the unique expertise afforded by Special Members (e.g.; the musical skill of an adjunct professor from the SA Symphony, an immunologist or biostatistician from the UTHSCSA, and the experience of a business leader or social worker) and other discussants focused on grandfathering previous UTSA faculty (e.g.; a UTSA faculty member supervising graduate students who accepts a position at another university or a semi-retired professor emeritus). As cons, some discussants questioned the teaching and mentoring skills of non-academicians (e.g.; a manager at HEB), some were very concerned about allowing academicians without a terminal degree guiding graduate students, some highlighted the importance of having a local perspective while chairing a thesis or dissertation committee, and some noted salary disparities as a potential administrative motivation.

A motion was made to only allow full-time tenured or tenure-track faculty members at UTSA to chair thesis and dissertation committees. The motion was seconded, but it was noted that the Handbook of Operating Procedures qualifies adjoint faculty to supervise theses and dissertations. Being inconsistent with the HOP, the motion was withdrawn. Another motion was made to strike “individuals with recognized expertise who are unaffiliated with institutions of higher education” from the proposed revision to the Bylaws. That motion was not seconded. Dr. Stuart Birnbaum suggested that striking the words “and/or co-chair thesis and dissertation committees” might serve as compromise. That suggestion was moved, seconded, and approved by a majority of the Graduate Council. Dr. John Alexander asked Dr. Dykes to email the modified proposed amendment to our Bylaws to the members. It is Attachment A.

**F. Committee on Graduate Program Evaluation (Norma Cantú)**

No report

**G. Committee on Academic Policy and Requirements (David Romero)**

No report

**IV. Unfinished Business**

Dr. McCrary reminded the Graduate Council of the upcoming vote for a graduate student seat on the University Center Advisory Council.

**V. New Business**

Dean Flannagan thanked Norma Cavazos for compiling a list of research and statistics graduate courses as requested by Dr. Kadapakkam (Attachment E of the Agenda). She suggested that any additional course descriptions could be sent to Norma Cavazos or Ginger Hernandez for inclusion.

Dr. McCrary announced that he will not serve as Chair of the Graduate Council next year. While he has enjoyed working with the Graduate Council and has been gratified to serve as Chair; other UTSA, community, and family responsibilities preclude his continued service. The birth of Everett Alan McCrary is imminent, perhaps coinciding with our April 7<sup>th</sup> meeting. Drs. Alexander and Cooke have agreed to join Dr. Romero on the Nominating Committee. He asked that volunteers contact him or a member of the Nominating Committee.

Dr. Bizios thanked Dr. McCrary for his service and wished him the best for his family and the future. The Graduate Council burst out in applause.

**VI. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 4:39.

**Attachment A**  
**Proposed Amendment to the Bylaws of the Graduate Council**

*Section 2.b of Article I (The Graduate Faculty) describes Special members. In the Bylaws, that section is currently:*

b. Special Members

University of Texas at San Antonio faculty members, who do not hold a full-time tenured or tenure-track appointment, including visiting, adjunct, or part-time faculty members, are eligible for appointment as Special Members of the Graduate Faculty upon recommendation by the Graduate Faculty of the department where they serve and/or the appropriate Graduate Program Committee and approval by the Graduate Council. Special Members may teach graduate courses, serve on graduate committees, and co-chair thesis and dissertation committees upon recommendation by the appropriate Graduate Program Committee and approval by the Graduate Council. The status of Special Members will be for three years, unless renewed.

*As modified at the March 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting (note the struck text), the proposed amendment under consideration is:*

b. Special Members

University of Texas at San Antonio faculty members, who do not hold a full-time tenured or tenure-track appointment, including visiting, adjunct, or part-time faculty members; full-time tenured and tenure-track individuals at other degree-granting institutions; and individuals with recognized expertise who are unaffiliated with institutions of higher education are eligible for appointment as Special Members of the Graduate Faculty. Special Members may teach graduate courses and/or serve on graduate committees ~~and/or co-chair thesis and dissertation committees~~ as specifically recommended by the Membership committee and approved by the Graduate Council. Applications must receive majority approval of the members of the appropriate Graduate Program Committee, the recommendation of the appropriate Graduate Program Chair, the recommendation of the appropriate Department Chair, and the recommendation of the appropriate College Dean. Applications are organized and submitted by the appropriate graduate program host. Applications must receive approval of a majority of members of the Membership committee or the recommendation of the Chair of the Special Membership if a quorum is unavailable and approval by the Graduate Council.

Special Member status will be granted for a three (3) year term, thereafter applications may be submitted for additional terms, except for the following:

- (a) Current staff in good standing at the University of Texas Health Science Center San Antonio and the Southwest Research Institute will be appointed for a five (5) year period, thereafter applications may be submitted for additional terms.
- (b) Individuals who do not possess the terminal degree or who do not have exceptional qualifications in the field of appointment will be appointed for no more than two (2) consecutive semesters.